

Health Care Stabilization Fund

300 S.W. 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Second Floor Topeka, Kansas 66603-3912 www.hcsf.org Rita L. Noll, Chief Counsel e-mail: rita.noll@ks.gov 785-291-3407

# Medical Professional Liability Experience Fiscal Year 2018

By Rita Noll Deputy Director and Chief Counsel

This report for the Board of Governors of the Health Care Stabilization Fund summarizes medical professional liability litigation experience in Kansas during fiscal year 2018. (Fiscal year 2018 covers the period of time from July 1, 2017 through June 30, 2018.) The report reflects statistical data gathered by the Fund in administering the Health Care Provider Insurance Availability Act and is based on all claims resolved during the fiscal year.

Medical professional liability refers to a claim made against a health care provider for the rendering of or failure to render professional services (K.S.A. 40-3403). Health care provider is defined in K.S.A. 40-3401 to include the following individuals: physicians, chiropractors, podiatrists, registered nurse anesthetists, nurse midwives, and physician assistants. "Health care provider" also includes the following entities: hospitals, ambulatory surgical centers, nursing facilities, assisted living facilities, and residential health care facilities. Certain professional corporations and professional limited liability companies may also be defined as a "health care provider".

It should be noted that dollar amounts will not necessarily correspond with the agency's accounting and budgeting documents because claims are not necessarily paid in the same fiscal year that the settlement was approved by the court, or the judgment was rendered by a jury. Data in this report reflects the status of cases at the end of the fiscal year. Data for prior years is for comparison purposes only, as case outcomes may have changed due to subsequent court proceedings.

Joel M. Feder, D.O. Jeffrey W. Glasgow, C.R.N.A. Harold M. Chalker, D.C. Kiley A. Floyd BOARD OF GOVERNORS

Jimmie A. Gleason, M.D., Chairperson John W. Mize, J.D., Vice-chairperson Robert N. Wright, MBA, CPA Donald W. Hatton, M.D. Steven R. Short, D.O. Travis W. Stembridge, M.D. Kevin D. McFarland

#### MEDICAL PROFESSIONAL LIABILITY EXPERIENCE

#### A. Jury Verdicts

From HCSF data, 12 medical malpractice cases involving 19 Kansas health care providers were tried to juries during fiscal year 2018. Ten cases were tried in Kansas courts and two cases involving Kansas health care providers were tried in Missouri courts. These trials were held in the following jurisdictions:

Johnson County	3
Sedgwick County	2
Cowley County	1
Douglas County	1
Lyon County	1
Riley County	1
Saline County	1
Clay Co., MO	1
Jackson Co., MO	1

Of the 12 cases tried, nine resulted in complete defense verdicts. Three cases resulted in a verdict for the plaintiff:

Case	Jurisdiction	Verdict Amount	HCSF Amount
Plaintiff v. Doctor	Johnson Co.	\$260,000	\$260,000
Plaintiff v. Doctor	Johnson Co.	\$920,370	\$720,370
Plaintiff v. Doctor	Lyon Co.	\$174,145	0

The following chart compares this year's experience to previous fiscal years:

Fiscal Year	Total Trials	Defense Verdict	Plaintiff Verdict	Split Verdict	Mistrials
2018	12	9	3		
2017	16	14	1	1	
2016	14	12	1		1
2015	18	13	2		3
2014	27	23	3		1
2013	18	14	4		
2012	21	19	1		1
2011	19	16	2	1	
2010	32	21	7	1	3
2009	27	20	5	1	1
2008	34	25	4	1	4
2007	36	31	5		
2006	29	23	6		
2005	34	22	7	3	2
2004	28	23	3	2	
2003	27	23	3		1
2002	19	10	6		1
2001	21	13	6	2	2
2000	28	18	7	1	2

Page 2

Page 3

#### **B.** Settlements

**Claims settled by the Fund**. During FY 2018, 73 claims in 58 cases were settled involving HCSF monies. Settlement amounts incurred by the HCSF for the fiscal year totaled \$24,238,950. These figures do not include settlement contributions by primary or excess insurance carriers. The settlement amounts are payments made, or to be made, by the HCSF in excess of primary coverage or on behalf of inactive health care providers.

Fiscal Year	Number of Claims/Cases	Fund Amount	Settlement Average
FY 2018	73/58	\$24,238,950.00	\$332,040
FY 2017	64/53	\$21,745,583.00	\$339,775
FY 2016	76/66	\$23,539,687.07	\$309,733
FY 2015	60/53	\$24,322,582.00	\$405,376
FY 2014	63/52	\$24,005,914.00	\$381,046
FY 2013	79/62	\$27,610,000.00	\$349,494
FY 2012	67/62	\$21,431,000.00	\$319,866
FY 2011	61/57	\$17,518,727.54	\$287,192
FY 2010	61/54	\$19,745,200.00	\$323,692
FY 2009	81/72	\$23,867,283.72	\$294,658
FY 2008	65/57	\$17,352,500.00	\$266,962
FY 2007	61/53	\$20,929,250.00	\$343,102
FY 2006	89/81	\$24,917,984.00	\$279,977
FY 2005	90/74	\$23,544,658.00	\$261,607
FY 2004	79/64	\$18,905,505.00	\$239,310
FY 2003	87/76	\$17,483,778.00	\$200,963
FY 2002	67/58	\$16,173,742.00	\$241,399
FY 2001	54/44	\$15,592,748.80	\$288,755
FY 2000	69/59	\$20,071,607.50	\$290,893

HCSF settlements fall within the following ranges and are compared to individual claim settlements in previous years:

	FY18	FY 17	FY 16	FY 15	FY 14	FY 13	FY 12	FY 11
\$1 - \$50,000	8	11	14	7	10	3	11	12
\$50,001 - \$250,000	23	21	26	19	23	31	21	25
\$250,001 - \$600,000	31	19	23	17	6	31	23	13
\$600,001 - \$1,000,000	11	13	13	17	24	14	12	11
Total Claims	73	64	76	60	63	79	67	61

Of the 73 claims, the Fund provided primary coverage for inactive health care providers in eight claims. Also, the Fund "dropped down" to provide coverage for two claims in which aggregate primary policy limits were reached.

Primary insurance carriers tendered their policy limits, or remaining policy limits, to the Fund in 64 claims. Therefore, in addition to the \$24,238,950 incurred by the Fund, primary insurers contributed \$12,755,050 to these settlements. Further, two claims involved contribution from an insurer whose coverage was excess of Fund coverage. The total of these contributions was \$2,895,000.

<u>FY</u>	Primary Carriers	HCSF	Excess Carriers	Total
2018	\$12,755,050.00	\$24,238,950.00	\$ 2,895,000.00	\$39,889,000.00
2017	\$11,057,500.00	\$21,745,583.00	\$ 1,425,000.00	\$34,228,083.00
2016	\$11,000,000.00	\$23,539,687.07	\$ 3,400,000.00	\$37,939,687.07
2015	\$11,200,000.00	\$24,322,582.00	\$14,400,000.00	\$49,922,582.00
2014	\$10,135,000.00	\$24,005,914.00	\$ 3,875,000.00	\$38,015,914.00
2013	\$13,310,000.00	\$27,610,000.00	\$ 6,000,000.00	\$46,920,000.00
2012	\$10,800,000.00	\$21,431,000.00	\$ 5,083,500.00	\$37,314,500.00
2011	\$10,400,000.00	\$17,518,727.54	\$ 4,350,000.00	\$32,268,727.54
2010	\$ 9,400,000.00	\$19,745,200.00	\$14,972,500.00	\$44,117,700.00
2009	\$11,471,170.00	\$23,867,283.72	\$ 4,954,830.00	\$40,293,283.72
2008	\$10,612,500.00	\$17,352,500.00	\$ 2,425,000.00	\$30,390,000.00
2007	\$ 9,488,750.00	\$20,929,250.00	\$ 3,125,000.00	\$33,543,000.00
2006	\$14,580,000.00	\$24,917,984.00	\$ 5,089,425.00	\$44,587,409.00
2005	\$15,800,000.00	\$23,544,658.00	\$10,450,000.00	\$49,794,658.00
2004	\$12,600,000.00	\$18,905,505.00	\$ 8,550,000.00	\$40,055,505.00
2003	\$14,200,000.00	\$17,483,778.00	\$ 2,787,500.00	\$34,471,278.00
2002	\$11,400,000.00	\$16,173,742.00	\$ 2,680,000.00	\$30,253,742.00
2001	\$ 8,800,000.00	\$15,592,748.80	\$ 6,710,000.00	\$31,102,748.80

**Claims settled within primary coverage limits.** In addition to the above settlements, the HCSF was notified that primary insurance carriers settled an additional 110 claims in 97 cases.

<u>Fiscal</u> <u>Year</u>	Settlement Reported Claims/Cases	<u>Amount Paid by</u> Primary Insurance Carriers
2018	110/97	\$10,537,420.00
2017	82/74	\$ 8,622,021.00
2016	98/93	\$ 8,968,479.00
2015	89/80	\$ 7,268,626.00
2014	97/86	\$ 8,909,740.00
2013	88/76	\$ 6,664,000.00
2012	98/81	\$ 6,603,521.00
2011	99/83	\$ 7,865,915.00
2010	110/92	\$ 8,958,622.00
2009	90/80	\$ 7,182,241.00
2008	104/88	\$ 8,486,032.00
2007	167/146	\$10,870,339.00
2006	110/98	\$ 8,545,218.00
2005	103/88	\$ 8,058,894.00
2004	99/85	\$ 6,978,801.00
2003	122/99	\$ 9,087,872.00
2002	141/124	\$10,789,299.00
2001	109/88	\$ 8,124,459.00

Page 4

#### Page 5

# C. HCSF Total Settlements and Verdict Amounts

During fiscal year 2018 the HCSF incurred \$24,238,950 in 73 claim settlements and became liable for \$980,370 for two claims as a result of jury verdicts. The following figures show total Fund settlements and jury awards since the inception of the Health Care Stabilization Fund.

<u>Fiscal</u> <u>Year</u>	<u>Total</u> <u>Claims</u>	<u>Settlements &amp;</u> Jury Awards	<u>Average</u> Per Claim
FY 2018	75	\$25,219,320.00	\$336,257.60
FY 2018	65	22,545,583.00	346,855.12
FY 2017	76	23,539,687.07	309,732.72
FY 2015	62	24,904,319.61	401,682.57
FY 2013	66	25,559,409.00	387,263.77
FY 2014	79	29,382,484.69	371,930.19
FY 2013	67	21,431,000.00	319,865.67
FY 2012	63	19,118,727.54	303,471.87
FY 2010	65	20,970,021.10	322,615.71
FY 2009	85	25,505,208.67	300,061.28
FY 2008	68	19,085,004.00	280,661.82
FY 2007	64	22,589,655.27	352,963.36
FY 2006	90	25,017,984.00	277,977.60
FY 2005	97	26,119,569.91	269,273.30
FY 2004	81	19,055,505.00	235,253.15
FY 2003	90	18,295,320.32	203,281.34
FY 2002	71	17,467,033.19	246,014.55
FY 2001	58	17,114,748.80	295,081.86
FY 2000	73	20,868,192.91	285,865.66
FY 1999	71	21,344,368.15	300,624.90
FY 1998	66	12,834,705.13	194,465.23
FY 1997	41	13,653,618.34	333,015.08
FY 1996	70	23,258,406.14	332,262.94
FY 1995	45	17,023,882.17	378,308.49
FY 1994	65	21,194,765.96	326,073.32
FY 1993	48	24,614,093.06	492,281.86
FY 1992	35	8,824,834.14	252,138.11
FY 1991	49	19,666,797.32	401,363.21
FY 1990	48	13,627,222.20	283,700.46
FY 1989	58	18,713,543.00	315,750.00
FY 1988	51	13,402,756.00	262,799.00
FY 1987	47	13,296,808.00	282,910.00
FY 1986	42	11,492,857.00	273,639.00
FY 1985	41	15,152,042.00	369,562.00
FY 1984	34	9,538,741.00	280,551.00
FY 1983	25	6,522,369.00	260,894.00
FY 1982	24	3,060,126.00	127,505.00
FY 1981	8	1,760,645.00	220,080.00
FY 1980	0	0.00	-
FY 1979	3	203,601.00	67,867.00
FY 1978	0	0.00	-
FY 1977	1	137,500.00	137,500.00

#### Page 6 D. New Cases by Fiscal Year

The Health Care Stabilization Fund was notified of 300 new cases during fiscal year 2018. The following chart lists the number of new cases opened in each fiscal year since the Fund was established over four decades ago.

Fiscal Year	Number of Cases
2018	300
2017 2016	276 248
<u>2015</u>	<u>248</u> <u>235</u>
<u>2015</u> 2014	<u>268</u>
2013	229
2012	260
2011	267
<u>2010</u>	<u>290</u>
2009	310
2008	329
2007	304
2006	457
<u>2005</u> 2004	<u>336</u> 368
2004 2003	392
2003	361
2001	341
2000	<u>294</u>
1999	319
1998	293
1997	318
1996	296
<u>1995</u>	<u>326</u>
1994	247
1993	263
1992	245
1992	230
<u>1990</u>	<u>205</u>
<u>1990</u> 1989	<u>205</u> 251
1988	285
1987	320
1986	276
<u>1985</u>	<u>245</u>
1984	175
1983	153
1982	124
1981	98
<u>1980</u>	<u>87</u>
1979	50
1978	19
1978	2
17//	2



Health Care Stabilization Fund

300 S.W. 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue, Second Floor Topeka, Kansas 66603-3912 www.hcsf.org Rita L. Noll, Chief Counsel e-mail: Rita.Noll@ks.gov 785-291-3407

# University of Kansas Foundations and Faculty; Residents Self-Insurance Programs/Primary Coverage Reimbursement to the Health Care Stabilization Fund

# I. <u>KU Foundations and Faculty</u>

#### Foundation Self-Insurance Program Costs

FY 2018 \$ 800,000.00 \$ 831,654.34	FY 2017 \$1,730,000.00 \$ 943,879.29	FY 2016 \$ 395,000.00 \$ 633,751.91	Settlement Amounts Attorney Fees and Expenses
\$1,631,654.34	\$2,673,879.29	\$1,028,751.91	Totals
4 40	10 29	4 36	Number of settlements Number of pending clams (end of FY)

#### **Reimbursable Amounts**

FY 2018 \$ 500,000.00 \$1,131,654.34	FY 2017 \$ 500,000.00 \$2,173,879.29	FY 2016 \$ 500,000.00 \$ 528,751.91	Reimbursement Private Practice Reserve Reimbursement State General Fund
\$1,631,654.34	\$2,673,879.29	\$1,028,751.91	Totals

#### II. <u>Residents in Training</u>

#### **Residents Self-Insurance Program Costs**

FY 2018 \$ 435,000.00 \$1,193,132.34	FY 2017 0 <u>\$642,342.05</u>	FY 2016 0 <u>\$693,324.56</u>	Settlement Amounts Attorney Fees and Expenses
\$1,628,132.34	\$642,342.05	\$693,324.56	Totals
3 25	0 30	0 19	Number of settlements Number of pending claims (end of FY)

Kiley A. Floyd Jeffery W. Glasgow, C.R.N.A. Harold M. Chalker, D.C. Joel M. Feder, D.O.

Jimmie A. Gleason, M.D., Chairperson John W. Mize, J.D., Vice-chairperson Robert N. Wright, MBA, CPA

**BOARD OF GOVERNORS** 

Donald W. Hatton, M.D. Steven R. Short, D.O. Travis W. Stembridge, M.D. Kevin D. McFarland

### III. Expenditures by Fiscal Year

Fiscal	Foundations	Total Number	Residents	Total Number
Year	and Faculty*	Faculty	in Training**	Residents
2018	\$ 1,631,654.34	735	\$1,628,132.34	849
2017	2,673,879.29	650	642,342.05	825
2016	1,028,751.91	652	693,324.56	856
2015	1,917,190.41	583	690,599.54	814
2014	2,175,457.87	573	799,363.81	789
2013	1,537,668.29	557	934,695.09	809
2012	1,759,733.60	506	1,201,108.99	787
2011	1,184,218.79	514	455,621.25	812
2010	1,445,658.21	412	1,201,718.01	698
2009	2,693,099.94	404	812,492.66	712
2008	966,327.58	366	648,269.80	692
2007	2,037,227.63	348	1,194,968.11	682
2006	1,407,837.70	361	871,719.27	675
2005	1,706,763.57	336	1,749,032.25	670
2004	1,825,116.29	317	2,787,112.99	627
2003	1,113,326.84	308	1,418,927.85	643
2002	583,566.19	307	723,834.54	645
2001	1,540,133.41	298	953,304.62	625
2000	691,253.39	310	735,633.12	645
1999	1,371,640.73	295	645,997.65	669
1998	1,018,435.78	283	1,072,324.05	637
1997	1,111,787.72	279	999,388.16	647
1996	4,003,062.51	285	1,331,521.75	641
1995	255,117.85	286	534,124.84	532
1994	1,959,284.79	287	574,758.65	603
1993	1,453,444.21	287	650,033.67	594
1992	645,670.10	281	810,703.77	592
1991	435,540.69	288	458,561.65	615
1990	261,035.55	277	120,796.12	546

#### \*Foundations and Faculty:

Amounts up to \$500,000 are reimbursed from the Private Practice Reserve Fund. Amounts over \$500,000 are reimbursed from the State General Fund.

#### \*\*Residents in Training:

Includes all residents in training at KUMC in Kansas City, and affiliated programs in Wichita and Salina. All amounts are reimbursed from the State General Fund.

#### IV. Monies Paid by the Health Care Stabilization Fund for Excess Coverage Claims

	FY 18	FY 17	FY 16	FY 15	FY 14
Residents	\$ 800,000	0	0	0	0
Faculty, Foundations	\$1,150,000	\$ <u>1,766,666</u>	\$625,000	<u>\$1,013,000</u>	\$2,975,000
Total	\$1,950,000	\$1,766,666	\$625,000	\$1,013,000	\$2,975,000